

ISSN 2222-5706

# NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry

Vol 11 (2), December, 2013



NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES  
ISLAMABAD PAKISTAN

## CONTENTS

ISSN 2222-5706

### Research Papers

**Tayyaba Tamim & Hana Tariq**

Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

**Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig**

The Question of Reclamation of "Ghost" Lives in J. M. Coetzee's *Foe*

**Aamir Shafi**

Punjabi Parents' Perception of Punjabi as their Children's Mother Tongue

**Maria Isabel Maldonado Garcia & Ana Borges**

Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary

Editorial Office  
Quality Enhancement Cell,  
Ghazali Block Extension, National University of Modern Languages  
Islamabad, Pakistan  
Tel: +92-51-9257646 Ext 341 & 214

NUML JCI is indexed & abstracted by Proquest & Ebscohost

Subscription Rates (per issue)  
Pakistan: Biannual: PKR 500/-  
Overseas: Biannual: US\$ 30

Vol 11 (2), December, 2013

NUML

Journal of Critical Inquiry

## **Patron-in-Chief**

Maj. Gen. (R) Masood Hassan HI (M)  
Rector, National University of Modern Languages

## **Patron**

Brig. Azam Jamal  
DG, National University of Modern Languages

## **Editor**

Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi  
Assistant Professor, Quality Enhancement Cell,  
National University of Modern Languages

## **Editorial Board**

### **Dr. Carl Leggo**

Professor  
Department of Language and Literacy Education,  
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

### **Dr. Dawn Langley**

Dean, General Education & Development Studies,  
Piedmont Community College, Roxboro, NC, USA

### **Dr. John Gibbons**

Adjunct Professor  
School of Languages, Cultures and Linguistics,  
Monash University, Malbourne, Australia

### **Dr. Phyllis Chew Ghim-Lian**

Associate Professor (Tenure)  
Department of English Language and Literature,  
National Institute of Education, Singapore

### **Dr. Bernhard Kelle**

Professor of Linguistics  
University of Freiburg, Freiburg, Germany

### **Dr. Steven Talmy**

Associate Professor  
Department of Language & Literacy Education,  
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

### **Dr. James Giles**

Professor Emeritus  
Department of English,  
Northern Illinois University, DeKalb, USA

### **Dr. Haj Ross**

Professor  
Department of Linguistics and Technical  
Communication, College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

### **Dr. Robin Truth Goodman**

Professor  
The English Department,  
Florida State University, USA

### **Dr. Masood Ashraf Raja**

Associate Professor  
Department of English,  
College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

### **Dr. Ryan Skinnell**

Assistant Professor  
Department of English,  
College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

### **Dr. Samina Qadir**

Vice Chancellor  
Fatima Jinnah Women University,  
Rawalpindi, Pakistan

### **Dr. Saeeda Assadullah Khan**

Former Vice Chancellor  
Fatima Jinnah Women University,  
Rawalpindi, Pakistan

### **Dr. Riaz Hassan**

Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences,  
AIR University, Islamabad, Pakistan

### **Dr. Nelofer Halai**

Professor  
Institute for Educational Development,  
Aga Khan University, Karachi, Pakistan

### **Dr. Shahid Siddiqui**

Professor & Director  
Centre for Humanities and Social Sciences,  
Lahore School of Economics, Lahore, Pakistan

## **Technical Assistance**

Mr. Muhammad Nawaz  
Computer Assistant, Quality Enhancement Cell, NUML

---

**CONTENTS**

---

**Contents**

**Editorial Board**

**Contributors**

**Research Papers**

Tayyaba Tamim & Hana Tariq	1
Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing	
Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig	20
The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J. M. Coetzee’s <i>Foe</i>	
Aamir Shafi	39
Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as their Children’s Mother Tongue	
María Isabel Maldonado García & Ana Borges	69
Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary	
<b>Copyright Statement</b>	86
<b>Disclaimer</b>	87
<b>Call for Papers</b>	88
<b>Subscription Form</b>	89

## **Editorial Board**

### **Patron-in-Chief**

Maj. Gen. (R) Masood Hassan HI (M)  
Rector, National University of Modern Languages

### **Patron**

Brig. Azam Jamal  
DG, National University of Modern Languages

### **Editor**

Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi  
Assistant Professor, Quality Enhancement Cell,  
National University of Modern Languages

### **Editorial Board**

Dr. Carl Leggo  
Professor  
Department of Language and Literacy Education,  
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

Dr. Dawn Langley  
Dean, General Education & Development Studies,  
Piedmont Community College, Roxboro, NC, USA

Dr. John Gibbons  
Adjunct Professor  
School of Languages, Cultures and Linguistics,  
Monash University, Malbourne, Australia

Dr. Phyllis Chew Ghim-Lian  
Associate Professor (Tenure)  
Department of English Language and Literature,  
National Institute of Education, Singapore

Dr. Bernhard Kelle  
Professor of Linguistics  
University of Freiburg, Freiburg, Germany

Dr. Steven Talmy  
Associate Professor  
Department of Language & Literacy Education,  
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

Dr. James Giles  
Professor Emeritus  
Department of English,  
Northern Illinois University, DeKalb, USA

Dr. Haj Ross  
Professor  
Department of Linguistics and Technical  
Communication, College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

Dr. Robin Truth Goodman  
Professor  
The English Department,  
Florida State University, USA

Dr. Masood Ashraf Raja  
Associate Professor  
Department of English,  
College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

Dr. Ryan Skinnell  
Assistant Professor  
Department of English,  
College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

Dr. Samina Qadir  
Vice Chancellor  
Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Dr. Saeeda Assadullah Khan  
Former Vice Chancellor  
Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Dr. Riaz Hassan  
Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences,  
AIR University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Dr. Nelofer Halai  
Professor  
Institute for Educational Development,  
Agha Khan University, Karachi, Pakistan

Dr. Shahid Siddiqui  
Professor & Director  
Centre for Humanities and Social Sciences,  
Lahore School of Economics, Lahore, Pakistan

## Contributors

### **Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing**

**Dr. Tayyaba Tamim (Main Author)** has her PhD in Education from University of Cambridge, as a fully funded RECOUP scholar and her Mphil from Cambridge University, as a British Council Chevening scholar. In addition, she has a Masters degree in English Language Teaching from Kinnaird College for Women University and Masters in English Literature from the University of Punjab. She also has a Diploma in ELT from the University of Punjab. She has 18 years of experience of teaching at different levels. She is currently working as Associate Professor and Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Humanities and Social Sciences & the Centre for Research in Economics and Business, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan. Her areas of interest are education, languages in education and language policy with references to social justice across gender, class and caste. Her work involves the use of capability approach to human development and Pierre Bourdieu' social critical theory.

Email: dr.tayyaba.tamim@gmail.com

**Hana Tariq (Co-Author)** is a student of MBA Finance at Lahore School of Economics. She has worked as Research Associate on different projects, including a recently completed World Bank and LSE funded project on Social Exclusion, Caste and Educational Opportunity in Rural Punjab. Apart from finance, her areas of interest are languages in education, health, and social justice with respect to class and caste.

Email: hana.tariq20@gmail.com

### **The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J.M. Coetzee’s *Foe***

**Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig** is a research scholar at National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad. He works in the integrated areas of Postcolonial, Feminist, Poststructuralist and Deconstructivist Cultural Studies. His imagination is captured by the aesthetics of the margins. The art of writing back to the standardized texts, cultures, characters, metaphors and stereotypes is the site of resistance where he looks for the possibility of hope, equity, justice and empowerment of the othered.

Email: zubairbaig313@gmail.com

## **Punjabi Parents' Perception of Punjabi as Their Children's Mother Tongue**

**Aamir Shafi** is currently working as an Assistant Professor of English at Government Shalimar College, Lahore. He has done his M. A. in TESL from Beaconhouse National University, Lahore and M. Phil. in Applied Linguistics from the University of Management and Technology, Lahore.

Email: amerschafi@yahoo.com

## **Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary**

**Dr. María Isabel Maldonado García (Main Author)** is an Assistant Professor/Incharge at Institute of Languages, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. Her research interests include cross-language similarities, multilingualism, language phylo-genetics, socio-linguistics, historical linguistics, etymological science, and second language acquisition.

Email: spanishprofessor1@gmail.com

**Ana Borges (Co-Author)** is a Lecturer, Institute of Languages, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. Her focus of interest in research is cross-language similarities, multilingualism, historical linguistics, and second language acquisition.

Email: ana\_borges@live.com

## **Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing**

**Tayyaba Tamim (Main Author)**

**Hana Tariq (Co-Author)**

### **Abstract**

The paper uses capability approach to human development as an evaluative framework to analyze the differential impacts of languages learnt in private and government schools on the valued dimension of participants' health and physical wellbeing. The findings discussed, in the paper, are a part of a wider 3-year qualitative study in urban Pakistan. The data emerging from 16 cases (each case comprising a final year secondary school student and his/her 5-6 year older same-sex siblings) reveal that poorly learnt English, against the perspective of wide use of English in the field of health in Pakistan, constrained the government school participants' range of choices regarding their physical wellbeing. Insensitivity to the linguistic diversity in the domain of health services and lack of linguistic capital of English restricted their agency to access health related information; participate in their management of health and make effective choices. The paper argues for acknowledging the linguistic diversity of Pakistan and making room for local languages in the provision of health services, while expanding the opportunities for learning English in Pakistan.

***Keywords:** health, languages in education, language policy, capability approach*

### **Introduction**

Language policies and the question of languages in education, in multilingual contexts, has been a subject of much debate because of the implications for resurrection of inequality (Pennycook, 1998; Rahman, 2006; Skutnab-Kangas, 1998; Tollefson, 1991). Languages are a subtle but potent tool of exclusion and discrimination (Bourdieu, 1991; Osama, 2012; Rahman, 2006; Tamim, 2013a; Tamim, 2013b). Robinson's (1996) study in African development perspective shows how ethnic and gender-based exclusion can result from the use of a certain language in development projects. A recent collection of sociolinguistic papers highlights the relationship of language choices and income poverty (Harbert, McConnell-Ginet, & Miller, 2008). However, there remains a gap for an integrated approach that conceptualizes languages in education and language policy in confluence with each other and explores it with reference to narrowly

## The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J.M. Coetzee’s *Foe*

**Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig**

### **Abstract**

John Maxwell Coetzee’s *Foe* (1986) is a rewriting of Daniel Defoe’s *Robinson Crusoe* (1719). In this rewriting, the woman, Susan Barton, has attempted at the excavation of the “ghost” lives from the canonical text. The fight for reclamation and recognition of the excluded other has been partially successful as major part of their life narratives remain inaccessible even in the retelling. This rewriting works on the other as “bearer” or “maker” of meaning moving to and fro from the world of silence to speech and vice versa. Susan’s resistant voice to patriarchy and colonial master interrogates the classic text but her presence in the narrative is directly confronted by the oppressive patriarchy to the effect that her partial story is delivered stillborn and larger part remains inaccessible for the readers.

**Keywords:** canon, rewriting/retelling, patriarchy, colonialism, silences

### **Introduction**

This essay explores how far the rewritings of the Western canonical texts could “re-right” the absences stereotyped in the patriarchal and colonial cultures. I have, particularly, focused on the feminist and postcolonial themes of voice, identity and representation of the marginalized. The imperial and patriarchal Other standardize the “lesser beings” of women and the colonized. The normative structures of canonicity mispresent and erase the objectified other to their advantage (Baig, 2012).

*Robinson Crusoe*’s story has been interrupted by Susan Barton’s narrative in *Foe* which is a rewriting of castaways, Susan Barton and Friday; and challenges the representation of the other by the imperial Other. The narrative of heroic Crusoe has also been shared by a woman and Friday who reclaim their part of the adventure. At the same time, it is also the story of a kidnapped daughter and a missing mother.

Foe, the English writer, is shown in debt with diminished energies for writing. Susan faces a daughter looking for her missed mother and claims her (Susan) to be her mother who does not recognize the girl. It is revealed in the text that it is Foe’s move to interpolate a daughter looking for her lost mother in the plot of Susan’s story in order to make her story

## **Punjabi Parents' Perception of Punjabi as Their Children's Mother Tongue**

**Aamir Shafi**

### **Abstract**

This study aims to explore the value which Punjabi parents attach to their mother tongue, especially with regard to its impact on their children. Two research questions related to the possible factors for indifference, namely Punjabi's role in providing a reasonable job and educational standards reflected by the Punjabi language, were formulated. A convenient sample of 75 Punjabi parents was selected. Questionnaires, containing six independent and six dependent variables, were distributed among the participants. As the study explores the phenomenon of parents' indifference, it may be regarded as exploratory and quantitative in nature. The results indicate that the parents do not consider Punjabi to be either economically beneficial or to have positive effect on education. A certain degree of linguistic insecurity is found among parents with regard to their mother tongue.

***Keywords:** mother tongue, indifference, linguistic insecurity*

### **Introduction**

Mother tongue gives an individual, as well as a group, his cultural identity. It is thus a common phenomenon world over that people communicate with their young ones in their mother tongue. The mother tongue is also a source of arousing feelings of loyalty with the group. To understand this concept we may imagine a situation when a person, living among speakers of a foreign language, hears his mother tongue and instantly becomes attentive to what is being said. This is because he experiences a sentimental bond with his mother tongue. UNESCO and other international organizations have also recognized the importance of mother tongue in the upbringing and development of a child.

Looking at the relative status of various major regional languages spoken in Pakistan, Punjabi comes across as the least popular among its native speakers. Jaffrelot (2002) observes that there is not a single Punjabi newspaper in Pakistan, and there is not a single school where Punjabi is taught.

Terdiman (1985) observes that language is closely associated with realities of power and selection of a language as medium of instruction can push others to periphery in terms of status and prestige. Shah (1997) points towards the irony of the situation in Punjab (see appendix 1) as he

## **Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary**

**María Isabel Maldonado García**  
**Ana Borges**

### **Abstract**

The current study is framed within the discipline of applied linguistics and falls within the scope of contrastive analysis between Portuguese and Urdu. Portuguese and Urdu are Indo-European languages, hence, share a genetic relationship. In addition, they integrate elements from other languages such as Arabic and Persian. The originality of this study is based on the fact that until now, comparative studies of both languages are inexistent. In addition, both have integrated different elements belonging to other languages, such as Arabic and Persian. Lexical borrowing plays a fundamental role in this study considering the Portuguese presence in India for centuries. A comparative analysis of phonetically similar terms in Portuguese and Urdu is performed in order to confirm their common origin, and level of similarity in the form through an etymological and string analysis. This investigation is a very interesting and important didactic instrument for the Pakistani students of Portuguese language and the Portuguese speaking students of Urdu, who will learn how to identify shared vocabulary between these languages, and utilize this vocabulary for learning a second language. It is equally important for those interested in the studies of Portuguese and Urdu.

**Keywords:** shared vocabulary, linguistic similarities, bilingualism, historical linguistics

### **Introduction**

The purpose of this research is to analyze 10 sets of terms which present phonetic similarities in Portuguese and Urdu languages. The rationale behind the comparison is to assist language students in the identification of shared vocabulary. In this case, it will be revealed whether the pairs have a common origin or not and possess other elements of similarity, such as semantics. The words from Portuguese language are *balde, braço, chá, chave, dez, girafa, hospital, sono, toalha, tu*.

As we move forward within the study, we should mention briefly the history of comparative linguistics. This is a branch of historical linguistics that deals precisely with the comparison between languages and thus establishes among them historical relations, for example their genetic

## **Copyright Statement**

Copyright © 2013, the authors assign to NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry and National University of Modern Languages a non-exclusive license to use this document for publication, personal use and in courses of instruction. The author also grants a non-exclusive license to NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry to use this document in worldwide publication, distribution and reprint in all languages, forms and media. Any other usage is prohibited without the express permission of the author.

## **Disclaimer**

While every effort has been made to authenticate material submitted by research scholars, the National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad, is not responsible for the content of papers accepted for publication in the NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry.

## **CALL FOR PAPERS**

The NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry delineates borders in specialization through increasingly focused research to reach for newer insights and achieve feats of understanding. It also motivates human capacity to connect with one another through active engagement in and exploration of issues and challenges ahead in jaded and didactic research practices. It brings in freshness and freedom which culminates into self discovery and profound realization of innovative pedagogical investigation. It encourages perception which is responsive, well informed, and cognizant and fosters ability to question established beliefs and conventions.

The NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry (ISSN 2222-5706) provides platform for researchers, classroom practitioners and academic professionals to share their novel theoretical and practical research initiatives in the areas of Language, Literature, Applied Linguistics and Education. Being multidisciplinary in nature, the NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry hosts stimulating, inspiring and informative research papers catering to the complex and increasingly diversifying multidimensional needs of learners, teachers and professionals in diverse contexts. Contributions that bring forward new ideas in pedagogy and creative thinking, generating new knowledge(s) through reasoning and research are welcome. The journal also accepts Book Reviews in related multidisciplinary areas.

As per NUML JCI Publishing policies, papers that have been in conference proceedings or have been published elsewhere are not accepted. In case a paper is based on a dissertation, the contributor must provide all the relevant details against which the submission may be validated.

We are receiving contributions for forthcoming issue now.

For more information please contact:

**Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi**

Editor, NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry

Email: [numl.editor@gmail.com](mailto:numl.editor@gmail.com)

# NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry

Quality Enhancement Cell  
National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad  
Email: [numl.editor@gmail.com](mailto:numl.editor@gmail.com)

## ORDER FORM

- Please accept my subscription for ..... year(s).
- Orders are accepted preferably for calendar year i.e. January to December and are non-refundable.
- I enclose my Pay Order/Bank Draft No. .... payable to Rector NUML (JCI Subscription), Islamabad, Pakistan.

**Local orders are to be made by Pay Orders and Foreign orders by Bank Drafts**

ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION RATES (per issue) - Please select:

*Inland*

*Foreign*

Pak. Rs.500/- ( )

US\$.30/- ( )

### **Address to which the journal is to be sent**

Name .....

Address.....

.....

Institution.....

Contact Number .....

Email .....

**Research Papers**

Tayyaba Tamim & Hana Tariq

Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig

The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J. M. Coetzee’s  
*Foe*

Aamir Shafi

Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as their Children’s Mother  
Tongue

María Isabel Maldonado García & Ana Borges

Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared  
Vocabulary

**Editorial Office**

Quality Enhancement Cell,  
Ghazali Block Extention, National University of Modern Languages  
Islamabad, Pakistan  
Tel: +92-51-9257646 Ext 341 & 214

**NUML JCI is indexed & abstracted by Proquest & Ebscohost**

**Subscription Rates (per issue)**

**Pakistan: Biannual: PKR 500/-**

**Overseas: Biannual: US\$ 30**